

CITY OF MUSKEGON
HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION
MINUTES

June 4, 2019

Chairperson J. Hilt called the meeting to order at 4:00 p.m. and roll was taken.

MEMBERS PRESENT: J. Hilt, K. George, L. Wood, K. Panozzo, A. Riegler

MEMBERS ABSENT: D. Warren, excused; S. Radtke

STAFF PRESENT: J. Pesch, D. Renkenberger

OTHERS PRESENT: A. Dake for the Muskegon Heritage Museum, 561 W Western Ave; E. Shedd for Parties in the Park

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

K. Panozzo stated that she was present at the May meeting but the minutes showed that she was absent. The May minutes will be changed to show that Karen was present.

A motion to approve the regular meeting minutes of May 7, 2019 with the above change, was made by J. Hilt, supported by L. Wood and unanimously approved.

NEW BUSINESS

Cases were heard out of order, with case 2019-10 being heard first, since the applicant was present.

Case 2019-10 – 561 W. Western Avenue (Banner). Applicant: Muskegon Heritage Association. District: Clay-Western. Current Function: Commercial. J. Pesch presented the staff report. The applicant is seeking HDC approval to install a banner sign on the west side of the building near the rear alley. The work has already been completed. Per HDC standards, any banner hung either with or without frames that contains a message, symbol, or which is simply a decorative addition is considered a sign. Banners, when permitted, are on an interim basis only and shall be annually reviewed by the Historic District Commission to ensure their sightly appearance.

Board members concurred that the sign was appropriate. A motion that the HDC approve the request to install a banner sign on the west side of the building near the rear alley as long as the work meets all zoning requirements and the necessary permits are obtained, was made by A. Riegler, supported by K. Panozzo and unanimously approved, with J. Hilt, K. George, L. Wood, K. Panozzo, and A. Riegler voting aye

Case 2019-08 – 350 W. Webster Avenue (Hackley Park) – Pavement. Applicant: Eric Shedd. District: National Register. Current Function: Park. J. Pesch presented the staff report. The applicant is seeking approval to pave 5' x 5' cement pads on both sides of the stage as well as a sidewalk along the north side of the stage. The paved areas would serve as a ground-level surface for moving and placing temporary speakers used by events held on the park's stage. Typically, staff can approve construction/reconstruction of driveways and sidewalks provided no material is historic in nature (i.e. historic pavers and bricks). However, the Historic District Commission requested to

review the proposed changes due to their location in Hackley Park. Other, similar proposals at Hackley Park were reviewed by the HDC in the past.

J. Pesch stated that the Parks Department told him that the raised areas on the sides of the stage were used for planters. It was also difficult to get speakers up there, since they were raised platforms. A. Riegler asked if the additions to the stage area would be symmetrical. J. Pesch stated that they would not, as one side would have a sidewalk in addition to the cement pad. K. George asked why they wanted a sidewalk on one side; she thought it might look odd and preferred to see a site plan showing the proposed improvements. E. Shedd arrived and answered board members' questions. He stated that they needed a sidewalk on the one side because that was where the stairs and the handicap-accessibility ramp were. There was also a large electrical box on the other side of the stage, which would have made it difficult to maneuver around. He stated that foot traffic and the speakers were already disturbing the landscaping there, and the ground was not always level. Adding the cement pads would fix that, and the sidewalk addition would allow easier accessibility to the stage.

A motion that the HDC approve the request to pave 5' x 5' cement pads on both sides of the stage as well as a sidewalk along the north side of the stage as long as the work meets all zoning requirements and the necessary permits are obtained, was made by L. Wood, supported by J. Hilt and unanimously approved, with J. Hilt, K. George, L. Wood, K. Panozzo, and A. Riegler voting aye.

Case 2019-09 – 508 & 512 W. Webster Avenue (House Move / New Construction). Applicant: Community enCompass. District: Clay-Western. Current Function: Vacant Lot. J. Pesch presented the staff report. The applicant is seeking approval to relocate the house currently located at 1190 Ireland Avenue to the vacant property at 508 and 512 W. Webster Avenue. The applicant is also requesting to construct a new, two-stall garage at the W. Webster location, sided with vinyl siding to match the existing house. According to HDC standards, new structures should be in keeping with the existing historical character of the neighborhood or district with a design that is compatible with the size, scale, material, and color of the surrounding buildings and landscaping.

J. Pesch stated that there were currently two vacant lots on Webster Avenue, but there was a boundary adjustment planned to create two buildable lots. K. George represented the applicant, Community enCompass. She stated that Avasure, the property owner of 1190 Ireland, contacted her to see if she wanted to salvage any parts of the house, as they planned to demolish it. She stated that the 5-bedroom house was in very good condition with all intact wood, and she preferred to preserve the house rather than build something new. She described the size and condition of the house, and felt that it would be a good fit for the Webster Avenue lot. She answered questions about the new garage and stated that it would match the house in scale and appearance. They planned to use vinyl siding, as there was already vinyl siding on the house.

A motion that the HDC approve the request to relocate the house currently located at 1190 Ireland Avenue to the vacant property at 508 and 512 W. Webster Avenue and to construct a new, two-stall garage at the W. Webster location sided with vinyl siding to match the existing house as long as the work meets all zoning requirements and the necessary permits are obtained, was made by A. Riegler, supported by K. Panozzo and approved, with J. Hilt, L. Wood, K. Panozzo, and A. Riegler voting aye. K. George abstained from voting due to being the applicant's representative.

Case 2019-11 – 380 Houston Avenue (New Construction). Applicant: Bethany Housing Ministries District: Houston. Current Function: Vacant Lot. J. Pesch presented the staff report. The applicant is seeking approval to construct a fourplex on this vacant lot. A site plan and elevation drawings were provided. The structure will be sided with SmartSide engineered wood siding and trim, and the

front of the structure will also have decorative trim to reflect existing homes in the area. HDC design guidelines for new construction were provided.

K. George stated that there had previously been a multi-unit home on this site but a fire at the structure led to its demolition. Board members reviewed the renderings. A. Riegler stated that she was concerned about the scale of the side elevations. K. George stated that, although the building appeared to be long, it would be a good fit for the lot as the lot was very deep. She explained the construction style, which was a pre-manufactured home. They had tried to come up with a design that fit with the rest of the houses on the street. A. Riegler asked what the square footage of the house would be. K. George stated that the building would be 30' x 60' and would contain 4 affordable rental properties. One unit on the ground floor would be fully accessible. She also stated that the house would be built to conform to the form-based code zoning for a multi-unit home. A. Riegler asked if there was any flexibility in the home's design, as she still had concerns about the scale. K. George stated that they had some leeway in trim details and suggested that they could add a frieze board and other details to make it unique. She expected that once the house was viewed on the lot, it would be a better fit than what was apparent in the drawing. A. Riegler and K. George discussed what features could be added to improve the home's appearance. K. George stated that, because of the pre-manufactured construction style, the renderings were not done locally so she was not able to add any details to the standard pictures. However, she assured board members that they would add exterior details to improve the appearance. J. Hilt suggested that landscaping could also benefit the building's appearance once it was installed. K. George stated that they did include landscaping in their budget.

A motion that the HDC approve the request to construct the fourplex as depicted in the drawings provided at the June 4th, 2019 HDC meeting except that the applicant will add exterior details to improve the appearance of the scale of the house, and to approve the use of SmartSide engineered wood siding and trim with additional decorative trim added to the structure, as long as the work meets all zoning requirements and the necessary permits are obtained, contingent upon review of final drawings reflecting the items discussed at this meeting, was made by K. Panozzo, supported by J. Hilt and approved, with J. Hilt, L. Wood, K. Panozzo, and A. Riegler voting aye. K. George abstained from voting due to being the applicant's representative.

OLD BUSINESS

Case 2018-42 – 240, 250, 254 Monroe Avenue (New Construction). Applicant: City of Muskegon/Dave Dusendang Custom Homes. District: Houston. Current Function: Vacant Lots. J. Pesch presented the staff report. At the December 4, 2018 meeting, a motion that the HDC approve the concept of six new modular rowhouses to be built on the vacant lots at 240, 250, and 254 Monroe Avenue was approved, but final approval was tabled until revised drawings were presented based on input given by the HDC. The applicant is now seeking final approval to construct the six rowhouses on three vacant lots on the north side of Monroe Avenue between 3rd Street and 4th Street (four additional rowhouses will be built across the street on 235 and 239 Monroe, but those will not be located in an historic district). The units will have attached garages accessed from the rear alley. Updated drawings were provided.

Board members did not like the updated drawings. The units' windows were shown as sliders instead of double hung, as was discussed and preferred at the previous meeting. They also did not like the vertical trim shown extending down from the end of the false roofline, and the front columns appeared too large and out of scale for the homes. Board members concurred that the photo shown on page 15 of the staff report was preferred over the new drawings (page 15 of the staff report was

appended to these minutes as Appendix A). J. Hilt asked if the board could recommend that the SmartSide engineered wood product be used instead of vinyl siding, especially since the previous case (case 2019-11), involving new construction, would be using that material. J. Pesch stated that they could.

A motion that the HDC approve the request to construct six rowhouses on the vacant lots at 240, 250, and 254 Monroe Avenue as depicted in the staff report drawing provided at the June 4th, 2019 HDC meeting, with the conditions that 1) the front elevation matches the elevation shown in the June 4 staff report (see Appendix A), 2) double-hung windows are used instead of sliders; 3) the vertical trim piece shown in the new drawings is eliminated; 4) the dimension of the front porch columns are built to within one (1) inch of eight (8) inches square; 5) that an engineered wood product is recommended over vinyl siding, and 6) the work meets all zoning requirements and the necessary permits are obtained, was made by A. Riegler, supported by K. Panozzo and unanimously approved, with J. Hilt, L. Wood, K. Panozzo, A. Riegler, and K. George voting aye.

OTHER BUSINESS

HDC Local Standards Review – J. Pesch stated that he would assemble a final draft of the revised HDC local standards, incorporating the various changes discussed over past meetings and present it to the board for approval at their next meeting.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 5:25 p.m.

APPENDIX A – PAGE 15 OF JUNE 4, 2019 STAFF REPORT

IV. OLD BUSINESS

Case 2018-42 – 240, 250, 254 Monroe – New Construction
Applicant: City of Muskegon/Dave Dusendang Custom Homes
District: Houston
Current Function: Vacant Lot

Discussion

At the December 4, 2018 meeting, a motion that the HDC approve the concept of building six modular rowhouses on the vacant lots at 240, 250, and 254 Monroe Avenue but table the approval until revised drawings were presented based on input given by the HDC, was approved. The applicant is seeking approval to construct six rowhouses on three vacant lots on the north side of Monroe Avenue between 3rd Street and 4th Street (four additional rowhouses will be built across the street on 235 and 239 Monroe, but those will not be located in an historic district). The units will have attached garages accessed from the rear alley. Updated drawings will be available at the meeting.



Original drawing submitted showing front façade

Standards

See above Design Guidelines for New Construction included with case 2019-9.

Deliberation

I move that the HDC (approve/deny) the request to construct six rowhouses on the vacant lots at 240, 250, and 254 Monroe Avenue as depicted in the drawings provided at the June 4th, 2019 HDC meeting as long as the work meets all zoning requirements and the necessary permits are obtained.